INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR QUALITY ASSUARANCE IN EDUCATION

STANDARDS AND CRITERIA OF ACCREDITATION FOR THE THIRD CYCLE (DOCTORAL STUDIES) EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS BASED ON THE EUROPEAN STANDARDS AND GUIDELINES FOR QUALITY ASSURANCE IN EDUCATION (ESG)

NUR-SULTAN, 2019

The standards and criteria have been prepared within the framework of the project "Promoting the internationalization of research through the establishment and operation of a third cycle quality assurance system in accordance with the European Integration Agenda (C3QA)" with the support of the Erasmus + program of the European Union.

The content of this publication is the responsibility of the authors and does not represent the official point of view of the Erasmus + program of the European Union.

PREFACE

1 *DEVELOPED* by the Independent Agency for Quality Assurance in Education considering the suggestions and comments of universities (IQAA).

2 *APPROVED AND PUT INTO EFFECT* by the order of the Independent Agency for Quality Assurance in Education of 26.06.2019, № 15.

3 **ORIGINAL HOLDER:** Independent Agency for Quality Assurance in Education: 010000, Nur-Sultan, 20 Dostyk str., office 801, Business Center "Saint Petersburg", tel. / fax: (87172) 27 38 20

4 EXPERTISE held at the "Expert" 20.09.2019 (expert conclusion № 01/01-05).

These standards may not be fully/partially reproduced or reproduced/distributed as an official publication without the permission of the Independent Agency for Quality Assurance in Education. (IQAA).

STANDARDS AND CRITERIA OF ACCREDITATION FOR THE DOCTORAL PROGRAMS

STANDARD 1. QUALITY ASSURANCE POLICY AND THE ACADEMIC INTEGRITY

1.1. General provisions

1.1.1 The quality assurance policy is the main directions and objectives of the higher education institution in the field of quality that is approved formally by top management based on the in-depth discussion in the work team.

The policy in the field of quality assurance of the educational program sets the directions for its development.

1.1.2 The system of internal quality assurance contributes to the effective implementation of the educational program, which is carried out in accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and international requirements for doctoral programs, in particular, to ensure a compliance with the ESG and the Salzburg Principles.

1.2. Policies and internal quality assurance system

1.2.1 The existence of a policy in the field of quality assurance of educational programs as part of the policy in the field of quality assurance of the university, which has an official status, accessible to all participants in the educational process and stakeholders.

1.2.2 The internal quality assurance system is considered as part of the quality assurance policy that aims to achieve the goals of strategic planning and educational programs of the university.

1.2.3 Ensuring of a free access for all participants of the educational process and other stakeholders to information about the system of internal quality assurance of educational programs as part of the policy in the field of quality assurance of the higher education institution.

1.2.4 Participation of the administration, faculty staff, employees in the formation and support of the policy of quality assurance of the educational program: responsibilities of departments, schools and other structural units. Participation of external stakeholders in the implementation of the program quality assurance policy.

1.2.5 Availability of measures to maintain academic honesty and academic freedom, to protect from any kind of intolerance and discrimination against students, faculty or staff.

1.2.6 Availability of the system "Antiplagiat" to check all written works of doctoral students: articles, methodological works, scientific research and dissertation.

1.2.7 Coverage by the internal quality assurance system of all types (educational, scientific and social) activities and stages of implementation (development, implementation and results) of the educational program with the participation of all stakeholders.

1.2.8 Informing all stakeholders about the results of the evaluation, changes in the content of the program and improvements in the conditions of implementation of the educational program.

1.2.9 Assessing the effectiveness of the system of internal quality assurance of the educational program on a systematic basis.

1.2.10 Application of the evaluation results in order to improve and adjust the long-term directions and content of the program, setting new goals in accordance with changes in the external environment.

1.3 Admission

1.3.1 Admission on the basis of clearly developed criteria available for applicants, which are transparent, with a description of the conditions of training, the opportunities offered by the program, as well as the possibilities of future employment.

1.3.2 Consideration of the professional experience and achievements of applicants upon admission.

1.3.3 The use of assessment methods identifying research potential of applicants, and foreign language knowledge (IELTS/TOEFL) in admission process.

STANDARD 2. CONTENT OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS

2.1 General provisions

2.1.1 In accordance with the Salzburg Principles, doctoral students should be perceived in the academic community as novice researchers who are able to make a key contribution to the generation of new knowledge.

2.1.2 The doctoral study program for the preparation of PhD in scientific and pedagogical route presupposes a fundamental educational, methodological, research training, and in-depth study of the disciplines in the relevant areas of science for the system of higher and postgraduate education and the scientific area (*for an educational program for the preparation of a Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in a scientific direction*).

2.1.3 The study program for the preparation of a Professional Doctors involves fundamental educational, methodological and research training and in-depth study of disciplines in relevant areas of science for the sectors of the national economy and social sphere: education, medicine, law, art, economics, business administration and in the field of national security and military affairs (*for an educational training program in terms of vocational training*).

2.1.4 The doctoral study program regardless of focus, supplies training of cadres that has the following competencies, reflecting the learningoutcomes, characterized by the following abilities of the student:

– obtain, discover, access, extract, interpret, analyze, evaluate, manage, store and transmit an ever-increasing amount of knowledge from a variety of sources;

– use a critical approach to solving problems, finding innovative solutions and creating new knowledge;

– to plan, manage and conduct research or projects by selecting and justifying the relevant methodological processes, at the same time identifying, assessing and minimizing risks and impact on environment;

– comply with professional standards in research and integrity of research and participate in professional practice, including ethical, legal aspects, safety [6].

2.2 Requirements to the content

2.2.1 Compliance of the content of the study program with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and international requirements.

2.2.2 Application of an interdisciplinary approach in the development of the content of the study program.

2.2.3 Application of student-centered approach in the development and implementation of the study program.

2.2.4 The content of the study program consists of:

– theoretical training with an emphasis on the methodology of research. When choosing basic disciplines, doctoral students learn specialized disciplines that are relevant to the topic of their thesis and minimize the number of academic disciplines and the amount of credits within the requirements of the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan;

– conducting the pedagogical and research activities, *(for the PhD study program in scientific and pedagogical route);*

– for the preparation of a Professional Doctors it is necessary to conduct practice-oriented research work related to their field *(for the study program in professional route);*

– final certification (preparation, writing and defense of a doctoral dissertation).

STANDARD 3. QUALITY OF THE FACULTY

3.1 The existence of a personnel policy in relation to faculty staff contributing to the quality implementation of the educational program that meets national qualification requirements (MES RK).

3.2 Personnel policy of the teaching staff for the doctoral study program should consider the following requirements:

a. Correspondence of the directions and areas of research activity of the teaching staff to the topic of the doctoral student's dissertation research;

b. Regulation of the maximum workload of teaching staff (the number of doctoral students per one supervisor);

c. Regulation of the requirements for the qualifications of both

scientific supervisors and consultants, including consultants from the production or industry sector for educational programs of doctors in the field.

3.3 Application of modern pedagogical teaching methods and innovations in the learning process.

3.4 Creation of conditions for a supervisor and a consultant (optimal distribution of the teaching load, financial resources, jobs, etc.) to fulfill their duties.

3.5 Invitation of highly qualified specialists from leading domestic and foreign educational organizations, research centers and manufacturing companies for scientific leadership (5th Salzburg Principle).

3.6 Creating of conditions for advanced training of national supervisors who provide scientific guidance.

3.7 The existence of procedures and rules that ensure:
a) professional and collegial scientific guidance of doctoral students
b) independence of the assessment of the results of doctoral studies with the involvement of external reviewers.

STANDARD 4. QUALITY OF RESEARCH WORK

The university creates conditions for doctoral students to carry out research work within the framework of dissertation work in accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and international requirements (Salzburg principles).

4.1 Compliance of the content of the doctoral student dissertation with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and international requirements.

4.2 The scientific and research work of a PhD doctoral student must comply with the following requirements of the SCSP RK:
- to be in compliance with the main issue of the educational program of doctoral studies;
- to be relevant and to contain scientific novelty and practical significance;
- to be based on modern achievements of science and practice: theoretical, research, methodological and technological materials;
- to be based on modern methods of processing and interpreting data using computer technology;
- to be performed using modern research methods;
- to contain research sections on the main provisions *(for a Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) educational program with scientific and pedagogical route)*

4.3 The practice-oriented research work of a professional doctoral student must comply with the following requirements of the SCSP RK:
- to be in compliance with the main issue of the educational program of doctoral studies;
- to be relevant and to contain scientific novelty and practical significance;
- to be based on modern achievements of science, technology and industry

8

and to contain specific practical recommendations, independent solutions to managerial tasks of a complex, cross-functional nature;

- to be performed using advanced information technology;
- to contain research (methodological, practical) sections on the main provisions *(for the educational training program of professional doctors)*

4.4 Doctoral students conduct a dissertation research within the framework of an interdisciplinary approach and international cooperation in the framework of inter-university cooperation with other partners.

4.5 Creation of conditions for doctoral students to carry out research work within the framework of a dissertation, preparation of a dissertation work, scientific articles, participation in international conferences and undergoing scientific internships in accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan (State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Rules on awarding a scientific degree, etc.) and international requirements.

4.6 Creation of conditions for doctoral students in the profile for conducting practice-oriented research work in the framework of production or industry problems; organizing research on the basis of companies or institutions with research potential; preparation of thesis, projects or articles on the topic of research; providing a production or industry base for experimental work or testing the results of research work; participation in international conferences and passing industrial internships in accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and international requirements.

4.7 Along with research skills (such as a knowledge of modern research methods and methodology, the ability to write, compile and publish scientific results in the form of scientific articles and monographs), it is necessary to develop doctoral students with transferable skills, such as the ability to work with big data, develop networking, manage projects, develop grant applications, work in group and team projects, have the skills of public presentation, etc.

4.8 Creation of conditions for the participation of doctoral students in group research projects developed in an educational institution within the framework of scientific grants funded by government bodies, or within the framework of industrial or sectoral research funded by interested private companies or institutions.

4.9 Implementation of systematic monitoring of the progress of the doctoral candidate research through annual dissertation milestones attestation.

4.10 The policies of the higher education institution are aimed at promoting and maintaining academic honesty in conducting research and preparing research results.

4.11 Assessment of the degree of borrowing by doctoral students of all written works and doctoral dissertations (verification system on the Anti- Plagiarism program, etc.).

4.12 The existence of mechanisms and procedures that ensure the conformity of the methods and methodology of the dissertation research of doctoral students with a humanitarian profile to the ethical standards of the researcher, generally recognized in research organizations. The existence of mechanisms to guarantee doctoral students the confidentiality, anonymity and consent of the researchers to publish the

data they provide.

4.13 Organization and creation of interactive and communication platforms and events for discussion, exchange of opinions and experience, as well as opportunities to share and test the results of research of doctoral students peer- to-peer, within expert communities or with other interested parties outside higher education institution, and outside the country.

STANDARD 5. EFFECTIVENESS OF THE SUPPORT SYSTEM FOR DOCTORAL STUDENTS

A higher education institution provides full support for doctoral students at all stages of study in the framework of the educational program.

5.1 Providing support to doctoral students of all categories, including doctoral students with disabilities and those who were transferred from other institutions, in solving academic, social and psychological issues.

5.2 Ensuring the work of services that assist doctoral students in academic mobility (internal and external) to gain additional experience and competences in the form of credits at higher education institutions in the country, the near and far abroad countries. Recognition and credit transfer gained during academic mobility and / or non-formal education.

5.3 Functioning of an effective system for the consideration and resolution of student complaints and appeals.

5.4 Ensuring an appropriate level of qualifications of staff providing support to doctoral students.

5.5 Creating appropriate conditions for efficient study of doctoral students with disabilities, foreign doctoral and employed students.

5.6 The existence of a mechanism for a regular evaluation of support services, that ensures its effectiveness.

STANDARD 6. RESOURCES

The available resources contribute to the achievement of the objectives of the educational program (Salzburg principle on the presence and promotion of innovative structures).

6.1 Availability and efficient application of material and technical resources to carry out research work and implementation of the educational program in accordance with the requirements of MES RK.

6.2 Availability of up-to-date equipment and laboratories that contribute to the qualitative implementation of research work of the study program, as well as ensuring their availability, operability, and compliance with current requirements.

6.3 Supporting and updating material and laboratory base, if they are available at higher education institution.

6.4 Availability of technical support services at the higher education institution (for example, instrumentation, glass-blowing laboratories and other services), which provide technical support in the smooth experimental work of doctoral students.

6.5 Using the possibility of a unified system of information support for doctoral students (for example, based on a Web site).

6.6 Providing doctoral students with access to full-text electronic databases of national and foreign journals, dissertations, databases Scopus, Thomson Reuters and other sources.

6.7 The existence of policies regulating mechanisms and sources of funding for doctoral students, including sources of funding for scholarships, research, purchase of equipment, participation in national and international conferences, meetings, symposia.

STANDARD 7. EFFICIENCY OF LEARNING OUTCOMES OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM AND PUBLIC AWARENESS

The higher education institution ensures the achievement of learning outcomes of the educational program and informing the public about its activities as part of the implementation of the study program.

7.1 The effectiveness of the educational program learning outcomes

7.1.1 Implementation of a systematic assessment of the progress of doctoral students and taking into account the results of this assessment in further improvement of the study process.

7.1.2 Ensuring the achievement of the expected results of the educational program.

7.1.3 The use of types of intermediate and final certification, contributing to the assessment of the level of achievement of learning outcomes, including the level of research skills.

7.1.4 Compliance of the competencies of the alumni of the study program with the requirements of the labor market.

7.1.5 Ensuring the effectiveness of doctoral studies, analysis and use of data on the defense of the doctoral students' dissertation.

7.2 Public awareness

7.2.1 Availability of information about the study program, admission requirements, expected learning outcomes, formative and summative assessment procedures, assignable qualifications and employment opportunities.

7.2.2 The existence of a procedure for the transfer and publication of final dissertation projects in international or national doctoral research databases or library databases.

7.2.3 Ensuring transparency and access of all stakeholders to the bases of dissertation research of doctoral students who successfully defended their

dissertations and received a Ph.D. degree or a Professional Doctor degree.

7.2.4 Informing the public about the results of the internal quality assurance system, internal and external evaluation.

STANDARD 8. CONTINUOUS MONITORING AND PERIODIC EVALUATION OF EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS, PERIODIC ACCREDITATION

8.1 Higher education institutions shall, based on the Agreement, annually undergo post-accreditation monitoring to evaluate the higher education institution for remedial actions and the implementation of recommendations on accreditation. In order to analyze changes and improvements in the educational program two years after accreditation under the Agreement, a visit to the university will be organized for one or two experts and a coordinator.

8.2 In case of non-compliance with the requirements of post-accreditation monitoring, the agency is entitled to suspend the certificate of accreditation of the educational program.

8.3 In accordance with the standards of IQAA and ESG, higher education institutions must undergo an external assessment – accreditation of educational programs on a regular basis once every five years.

References:

1. Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG). (2015). Brussels, Belgium. ISBN: 978-9-08-168672-3.

2. Qualification requirements for educational activities, and a list of documents confirming compliance with them. (Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated November 16, 2018 No. 634 shall be enforced upon expiry of twenty one calendar days after the day of its first official publication).

3. Salsburg principles http://c3qa.iqaa.kz/images/c3qa/files/Ten%20 basic%20principles%20for%the%20third%20cycle_2015.pdf.

4. Salzburg II Recommendations European universities' achievements since 2005 in implementing the Salzburg principles http://c3qa.iqaa.kz/images/c3qa/files/ Salzburg%20Remommendations.%20European%20Universities%E2%80%99%20 Achievements%20since%202005%20in%20Implementing%20the%20Salzburg%2 0Principles_2010%20.pdf.

5. State Compulsory Standard for Postgraduate Education. (Approved by the government's resolution of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 23.08.2012 № 1080).

6. Rules for Degrees Awarding. (Order of the Minister of education and science of 31.03.2011 № 127).

7. Characteristics Statement Doctoral Degree. UK Quality Code for Higher Education. (2015). The Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education, Southgate House, Gloucester, UK.